arXiv:0904.4573v1 [math.CO] 29 Apr 2009

A short proof of Combinatorial Nullstellensatz

Mateusz Michałek

In this note we give a short, direct proof of the following theorem of Alon [**1**].

THEOREM 1. (Combinatorial Nullstellensatz [**1**]) *Let $\mathbb{F}$ be an arbitrary field, and let $P(x_1,\ldots,x_n)$ be a polynomial in $\mathbb{F}[x_1,\ldots,x_n]$. Suppose the degree* $\deg(P)$ *of P is $\sum_{i=1}^n k_i$, where each k_i is a non-negative integer, and suppose the coefficient of $x_1^{k_1}x_2^{k_2}\cdots x_n^{k_n}$ in P is non-zero. Then for any subsets $A_1,\ldots,A_n$ of $\mathbb{F}$ satisfying $|A_i|\geq k_i+1$ for all $i=1,2,\ldots,n$, there are $a_1\in A_1,\ldots,a_n\in A_n$ so that $P(a_1,\ldots,a_n)\neq 0$.*

PROOF. The proof is by induction on the degree of P. If $\deg(P)=1$ the theorem is trivial. Suppose $\deg(P)>1$ and P satisfies the assumptions of the theorem but the assertion is false, that is $P(x)=0$ for every $x\in A_1\times\ldots\times A_n$. Without loss of generality $k_1>0$. Fix $a\in A_1$ and write

$$(*)\qquad P=(x_1-a)Q+R$$

using the usual long division algorithm for polynomials. Formally equation (*) is an identity in the ring of polynomials in one variable x_1 with coefficients in the ring $\mathbb{F}[x_2,\ldots,x_n]$. Since the degree of R in the variable x_1 is strictly less than $\deg(x_1-a)$, the polynomial R does not contain x_1 at all. By the assumption on P it follows that Q must have a nonvanishing monomial of the form $x_1^{k_1-1}x_2^{k_2}\cdots x_n^{k_n}$ and $\deg(Q)=\sum_{i=1}^n k_i-1=\deg(P)-1$.

Take any $x\in\{a\}\times A_2\times\ldots\times A_n$ and substitute to the equation (*). Since $P(x)=0$ it follows that $R(x)=0$, too. But R does not contain x_1, hence R vanishes also on $(A_1-\{a\})\times A_2\times\ldots\times A_n$. Now substitute any $x\in(A_1-\{a\})\times A_2\times\ldots\times A_n$ to (*). Since x_1-a is non-zero, it follows that $Q(x)=0$. So Q vanishes on $(A_1-\{a\})\times A_2\times\ldots\times A_n$, which contradicts the inductive assumption. □

The theorem is also true when $\mathbb{F}$ is any integral domain. If we omit the integrality assumption and take any commutative ring with unity as $\mathbb{F}$, then the proof works if for any two elements $a,b\in A_i$, $(i=1,\ldots,n)$, the difference $a-b$ is not a zero divisor in $\mathbb{F}$.

Theorem 1 has many useful applications in Combinatorics, Graph Theory, and Additive Number Theory (see [**1**]). As an illustration we apply it in the proof of Erdös Heilbronn Conjecture. It was first proved by da Silva and Hamidoune, and then by Alon, Nathanson and Ruzsa in a more general setting.

THEOREM 2. *Let p be a prime and let A and B be two non-empty subsets of $\mathbb{Z}_p$. Let*

$$C=\{x\in\mathbb{Z}_p : x=a+b \text{ for some } a\in A, b\in B, a\neq b\}.$$

Then

$$|C| \geq \min(p, |A| + |B| - 3).$$

PROOF. Only the case $p > 2$ is interesting. If $\min(p, |A|+|B|-3) = p$, then for any $g \in \mathbb{Z}_p$ the sets A and $g-B$ have got at least two different elements in common. Let a be one that is different from $\frac{g}{2}$, then $g = a + b$ for some $b \in B$ different from a. This proves that $g \in C$, so $C = \mathbb{Z}_p$. Suppose now that $|A| + |B| - 3 < p$ and the theorem does not hold. In that case there exists a set D such that $C \subseteq D$ and $|D| = |A| + |B| - 4$. We define two polynomials:

$$P(x, y) = \prod_{d \in D} (x + y - d) \quad \text{and} \quad Q(x, y) = P(x, y)(x - y).$$

Clearly $P(a, b) = 0$ for any $a \in A$, $b \in B$, $a \neq b$, so $Q(a, b) = 0$ for any $a \in A$, $b \in B$. One can also see that the coefficient of $x^i y^j$ in $P(x, y)$ is equal to $\binom{|D|}{i}$ if $i+j = |D|$. So if $i + j = |D| + 1$ then the coefficient of $x^i y^j$ in $Q(x, y)$ is equal to $\binom{|D|}{i-1} - \binom{|D|}{i}$. This is equal to zero if and only if $i = \frac{|D|+1}{2}$ in $\mathbb{Z}_p$. Since $|D|+1 = |A|+|B|-3$ one of the coefficients of either $x^{|A|-1}y^{|B|-2}$ or $x^{|A|-2}y^{|B|-1}$ is nonzero. Using Theorem 1 and the fact that $\deg Q = |A| + |B| - 3$ we get a contradiction. □

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Jarek Grytczuk for encouraging me to publish this paper.

References

[1] N. Alon, Combinatorial Nullstellensatz, Combin. Prob. Comput. 8 (1999), 7-29.

MATHEMATICAL INSTITUTE OF THE POLISH ACADEMY OF SCIENCES, UL. ŚNIADECKICH 8, 00-950 WARSZAWA, POLAND
E-mail address: wajcha2@poczta.onet.pl

UNITÉ MIXTE DE RECHERCHE 5582 CNRS — UNIVERSITÉ GRENOBLE 1, 100 RUE DES MATHS, BP 74, 38402 ST MARTIN D'HÈRES, FRANCE